

## **Cordell Bank Advisory Council Meeting Minutes**

### **June 3, 2009**

Meeting began at 9:30 am

**Welcome, Roll Call, Review Agenda**  
**-George Clyde**

#### ***Council Members Present:***

George Clyde- Community at Large- Marin County  
Liza Crosse- Community at Large-Marin Alternate  
Todd Steiner- Conservation Alternate  
Jaime Jahncke- Research Alternate  
Vic Chow- Education  
Bill McMillon- Education Alternate  
Dayna Matthews- National Marine Fisheries Service Law Enforcement  
Nick LaJoie- U.S. Coast Guard  
Elisa M. Garrity- U.S. Coast Guard

#### ***Staff members present:***

Dan Howard- Superintendent  
Michael Carver- Resource Protection  
Lisa Etherington- Research Coordinator  
Kaitlin Graiff- Research Specialist  
Dale Roberts- Biologist/Data Manager  
Pam van der Leeden- GIS Specialist  
Brian Johnson- GFNMS Deputy Superintendent  
Matt Pickett- Sanctuary HQ Operations  
Lorraine Anglin- West Coast Region Operations Coordinator

#### ***Members of the public present:***

Tom Lambert- former SAC chair  
Joe Smith- former SAC member  
Jackie Dragon- Pacific Environment  
Michael Milne- Sea Turtle Restoration Project

**Review of April Minutes**  
**-Dan Howard**

#### ***Group discussion***

General discussion on utility and detail necessary in meeting minutes. Suggestion of a

template for future minutes.

*Motion to accept April SAC meeting minutes as final- Todd Steiner approved*

*Seconded- Jaime Jahncke*

*All in favor*

### **Public Comment:**

#### **Joe Smith**

Is happy to announce that the establishment of the Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation (CMSF) is almost complete. Received 501 C3 last week and waiting for state tax-exempt status. CMSF goals are to support CBNMS research and education projects.

#### **Tom Lambert**

Goal is getting funds to CBNMS research and education projects.

Will be modeled on GFNMS foundation which has a web page where people can donate.

Will write grant proposals as well.

Will partner with national foundation in DC.

National foundation takes 50% of funds donated, but reaches a much wider audience.

#### *Group discussion*

Recommendation to categorize funds as discretionary for maximum flexibility, as a general fund. Comment that other foundations and sanctuary staff have differed over spending priorities in the past.

### **Superintendent's Report**

#### **-Dan Howard**

#### *Boundary expansion bill*

Boxer and Feinstein reintroduced boundary expansion bill in the Senate as S212, the House bill is H223.

The bill has passed the senate committee. Now it goes to the full senate.

Is essentially the same bill as last year, appropriations language was reinstated.

Will go to the house in the next couple of months.

#### *Our new NOAA administrator*

Jane Lubchenco is an oceanographer, knows the west coast, and is a sanctuary supporter.

#### *Office of National Marine Sanctuary/ National Marine Fisheries Service meeting*

Approximately 90 people from NOAA Sanctuaries and Fisheries met in Monterey last week.

This was an outgrowth of an Inspector General report that recommended sanctuaries and fisheries work better together.

Dan relayed several interesting possibilities for work in the sanctuary.

1. NMFS autonomous underwater vehicles could map deep-water habitat.
2. NMFS global biodiversity project may deploy settling plates within the sanctuary.
3. NMFS interest in Richmond whaling station oral history project collaboration.

#### *CBNMS office expansion*

We are in the second design stage called the design development stage and architects will be drawing up more detailed plans of the office expansion and storage facility.

#### *Graham Hawks*

Showed off his new vehicle at a California Academy of Sciences function.

He will be "flying" his new vehicle in MBNMS this summer.

He is interested in collecting data and filming at Cordell Bank.

The vehicle dives to 2,000 feet at speeds up to 6 knots.

The hull was fabricated locally, in Marshall.

Suggestion to auction off a flight in the cool new vehicle to benefit Cordell Bank.

#### *The climate change site scenario document*

Draft will be completed this Friday with the final report expected mid-summer.

#### *Our budget*

Not good news- the fifth year of a steady decline. We are planning for another 5% decrease in the next fiscal year.

#### *Group discussion*

The SAC's role and ability to advocate for the boundary expansion bill through letter writing or other means. Comment that we could learn from local counties, who are very effective at networking.

### **Education Report**

**- Dan Howard for Jennifer Stock**

#### *Ocean for Life Program*

A pilot education program bringing together students from the Middle East and the U.S. for a two week immersion program focused on the ocean.

Marine education activities.

Funded by the Sanctuary program.

Jennifer is coordinating the northern CA portion of the program with staff from Gulf of the Farallones and Monterey Bay sanctuaries.

#### *Oral history project*

Jennifer will be working with Dewey Livingston, a local historian to record oral histories of Cordell Expedition divers. The first two interviews will be with Bob Schmieder and Harry Sherman.

Jennifer is organizing an interview panel of Cordell Expeditions divers and celebration at the Point Reyes Dance Palace to formally recognize them. The celebration will take place on October 24 in combination with CBNMS 20th Anniversary.

*Fulmar cruises combining education and science*

Will partner with PRBO Conservation Science and include a NOAA teacher at Sea in our next regional monitoring cruise. Teacher will create a Google Earth layer that incorporates sanctuaries and monitoring data.

*CA signage plan*

Jennifer asked for suggestions for new sign locations.

The next big push for signs will be from Bodega Bay to Fort Ross, although this is on hold until the sanctuary expansion bill is decided.

*Podcast of show with Bob Schmeider now available*

*CBNMS Website redesign*

Coming up soon and we will be improving and adding new content.

Web statistics continue to improve.

*Copies of our DVD available of Blue Water Oasis*

The 15 minute feature film on Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary will be showing at the Point Reyes National Seashore Bear Valley visitor center.

*The next film series*

Will be shown in partnership with the National Park Service on June 12.

**Research Report**

**-Lisa Etherington**

*Lisa introduced our new research specialist Kaitlin Graiff.*

*Condition report will be released on June 15th.*

Electronic copies available and on web, as well as hard copies.

*There is a new oceanographic buoy at CB.*

Staff from Bodega Marine Laboratory is helping to maintain it.

Collecting data on salinity, temperature, turbidity, and fluorescence.

*Received NOAA coral reef conservation program funding*

Will be doing work to build on preliminary predictive habitat model that was completed last year.

*NOAA experimental SRVx- will not be operating this year*

No operating funds so SRVx will be tied up this year.

We are testing out the Mussel Point for ocean monitoring- first cruise went well.

*Hosted research coordinators meeting last month in Camp Gualala*

*Attended international marine conservation congress in Fairfax, VA*

Focus on integrated ecosystem assessment tool.

Attended Google Earth training at the meeting which has lots of potential for education

*Dale and Kaitlin met with CA Academy of Sciences*

Are working on database for cataloging species.

Dan commented that we are planning a maritime heritage dive for Fall 2010.

The dives will have research value as Cordell Expeditions dive locations will be re-located and photographs and samples will be collected.

*Group discussion*

The SAC's role in calling attention to deficiencies with the Fulmar as a platform for research. Discussion centered on length of crew workday and instrument calibration.

## **Resource Protection Update**

**-Michael Carver**

*Oil spills*

He attended an oil spill response meeting hosted by Exxon Mobil.

Learned about new technologies- dispersants, skimmers

"What is the best possible response to minimize environmental damage?"

Three possible responses:

no response

in situ burning

dispersants

Sanctuary is not pre-approved for use of dispersants.

Dispersants benefits and tradeoffs need to be weighed.

NOAA uses "ecological risk assessment" process.

*Group discussion*

Cost benefit analysis for oil recovery. Best-case scenario is 20% of spilled oil recovered, although Cosco Busan spill recovery inside the bay was very high: 30%.

### *Ship traffic*

AIS is an automatic ship identification system.

Can view ships on the web in real time.

Will allow us to see what traffic is offshore; positions are recorded every minute and archived in a database.

May be useful for whale strikes, buoys run over by ships.

### *Air quality*

CA air resources board (CARB) measures air particulates.

Tankers and other vessels account for roughly 25% of our air pollution.

CARB- instituting a voluntary speed reduction to 10 knots within 20 nautical miles offshore.

CARB is working in collaboration with EPA to reach beyond state waters (3nm) to 20 nm.

Fall 2009 draft ruling expected from CARB.

The SAC may want to comment at that time.

Jackie Dragon commented that the data show that slowing ships down reduces fatality of strikes and keeps carbon out of the atmosphere, relating to ocean acidification.

Slowing to 10 knots is cleaner, quieter, and safer.

### *Twin Otter plane*

Michael is working with Matt Pickett to take advantage of the NOAA Twin Otter plane for aerial surveys and enforcement in CB.

## **Council Member Reports**

### **George**

Is working with the Coast Guard "aids to navigation group" to get buoys properly located at Tomales Bay entrance- a public safety issue.

Has restarted KWMR news reports and is requesting story ideas relating to the marine world.

### **Jaime**

PRBO is planning to produce an annual status of Gulf of the Farallones sanctuary report that will summarize PRBO's work for sanctuaries on birds and mammals. Interested in fishing effort as well. Will be available to the public. Needs input on what type of information and what format would be most interesting and useful. Focus area will be from Pt. Arena to Año Nuevo.

He is working on a model to predict coastal bird and mammal distributions from Vancouver to Mexico using remotely sensed data, bathymetry, field surveys of birds and mammals and fisheries data as inputs. The goal is identify hotspots of abundance and biodiversity.

**Dayna**

Sanctuaries and office of law enforcement joint document have produced a three-year strategic plan and are requesting funding from congress. The plan has three elements: uniformed officer presence, technology, outreach and education. This is a public document.

The new CB enforcement group had their first meeting. The group is an outgrowth of an Inspector General review which recommended closer coordination between the office of law enforcement and sanctuaries. The strategic plan was reviewed and will be emailed to Dan soon.

**Vic**

A successful new, one day educational program had value for high school students who learned about marine biology and removed invasive mud snails in Bodega Harbor.

A new five-year education project involving Bodega Marine Lab (BML) and eight high schools including Tomales High. Jennifer Stock will serve as advisor to the program.

This past spring 1800 students participated in marine science activities led by Vic and his wife and graduate students from BML.

**George**

Attended SAC chairs conference in Thunder Bay for Lance and has summary and materials to pass around. Sanctuary leadership in ocean acidification was emphasized. Jaime commented that OCNMS will monitor ocean acidification using a dissolved oxygen sensor (on a CTD) at regular monitoring stations.

**Exempted Fishing Permit for Midwater Harvest at Cordell Bank NMS**

**-Dan Howard**

Since last meeting, Dan was approached by Barbara Emely and her husband, Ecotrust and the Pacific Coast Fisherman's Association who want to develop a regional fishermen's cooperative in the SF bay area.

They have a proposal to the ocean protection council- (CA) to fund development for business plan for the cooperative.

They are also seeking an exempted fishing permit (EFP) to fish midwater schooling rockfishes that occur off our coast.

They want to show that they can fish selectively without getting restricted fish bycatch.

The target species is chili pepper rockfish using hook and line from small boats.

Dan would have liked to have been able to get input from the SAC on this issue quickly.

*Group discussion*

The need to have a mechanism in place to address time-sensitive issues that arise between SAC meetings. The usual process is to do a public announcement giving 2-3 weeks notice.

Suggestion of a standing "executive" or "sub council" committee- most SACs have this. It's a way to get quick input (within two days) and does not circumvent official process, but rather supplements it.

**\*\*\*Action Item-** *Dan Howard, George Clyde*

Dan and George will look into the possibility of creating a standing "executive or "sub-council" committee within the SAC.

Dan-

NMFS is considering a long-line exempted fishing permit (EFP).

Michael Milne and Todd are interested in drafting a resolution opposing the EFP.

Dan feels we need our maritime seat filled before we do this but we've been unable to fill the position for six months.

*Michael Milne briefing on leatherback turtles and the long-line EFP.*

We've lost 95% of the leatherback turtle population in the past 25 years.

Most of decline attributed to pelagic fisheries, specifically long-line fishing.

Historically never existed in EEZ, is banned by state of CA

Data not statistically significant on whether long-line method is good for fishing or would not harm turtles.

NMFS is ready to approve the permit, excluded Coastal Commission from process.

Swordfish is target species, thresher sharks also taken in this fishery.

*Group discussion*

Potential EFP impact to CB and local fishermen. Long-lines are not allowed in the sanctuary.

According to Milne, no fishermen in northern CA are fishing for swordfish with long-line and long-liners are based in southern CA.

Discussion on what rejection of EFP might mean to the larger picture of fishing pressures. Discussion on the effectiveness of turtle excluder devices and the politics of American leadership in regulating international fisheries.

**\*\*\*Action Item-** *Dan, Todd and Michael Milne*

Invite Mark Helvey to present on the EFP at next SAC meeting.

Also invite member of conservation community to present.

The plan is to have the two presentations - 15 minutes each followed by a SAC vote on resolution to oppose NMFS action to issue the EFP.

**\*\*\*Action Item-** *All SAC members*

Dan requests all SAC review EFP document for next meeting.

Also read the sanctuary act and think about what our mission is.



## **National Marine Sanctuary Program Twin Otter Aircraft**

**-Matt Pickett**

Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary has an aerial monitoring program called SAMSAP (sanctuary aerial monitoring and spatial analysis program).

Datasets from 1997 to 2004 on vessel distributions.

Surveys done at 1,000 feet, mostly for cetaceans but can do seabirds as well.

Data used during the sanctuary marine reserve process, for five-year change analyses, to prevent whale ship strikes.

Blue whales in Santa Barbara channel 2007 four fatalities from ship strikes.

Using data on whale distribution and abundance were able to pinpoint areas at high-risk for strikes, broadcast notice to mariners, voluntary ship slow down.

Twin Otter plane has regional capability, and is an existing asset and crew, available for emergency response.

Aware of sensitivities about using NOAA aircraft as an enforcement platform and a research platform.

Plane is not fully funded in the base-budget.

Matt asked for a letter of support from SAC to NOAA leadership for funding for Twin Otter. GFNMS and CINMS SACs have written letters in support.

## **Questions for Matt Pickett**

### *Group discussion*

Letters of support in general, type of funding being requested, whether SAC can act immediately.

Group expressed support for the concept.

On motion by Todd Steiner, seconded by Vic Chow, the Council unanimously agreed to send a letter to NOAA seeking base funding for the Twin Otter aircraft, subject to:

1) Dan checking with Sanctuary headquarters to confirm the correctness of this procedure, and

2) Circulation of a copy of the draft letter to SAC members for final comment.

### **\*\*\*Action Item-** *Dan Howard, CB staff*

Dan will consult with Karen Brubeck- national SAC coordinator.

Letter will be drafted by CB staff and sent to SAC for review prior to next meeting.

## **Alternative Energy Issues Specific to Cordell Bank, and Possible Council Actions**

**-Jaime Jahncke**

### *Update from Jaime on wave energy project*

Map shown that was provided by David White with NMFS in Santa Rosa.

Permits granted by the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission (FERC) to the Sonoma

County water agency for development of coastal wave energy.

Areas may be a maximum of 20 nautical square miles.

MLPAs were not considered during the proposal process. Original three areas were rejected.

Areas currently proposed:

Moore landing

North zone

South zone

Initial permit allows the wave energy company to apply for a license to do a project.

Company is applying for license and now needs to do studies, planning, cable, onshore, outreach to community.

BML is the designated academic partner for any studies.

David White has filed with FERC as an intervener on behalf of NOAA. This means FERC must keep us posted and we are allowed to comment on the project. The SAC will not take any action for now.

#### *Group discussion*

Considering zones in ocean where wave energy projects would be allowed, implications if the sanctuary expansion bill passes, the sanctuary program's position on wave energy.

GF has opposed the testing of alternative energy technology in the sanctuaries

#### **\*\*\*Action Item-** *Jaime Jahncke, CB staff*

Jaime will attend project stakeholder meetings as well as a representative from CB staff.

*Motion to adjourn by Todd Steiner.*

*Seconded by Vic Chow.*

*All in favor.*

**Meeting ended at 3:15 pm.**

### **Attachment A: Action Items Summary**

#### **\*\*\*Action Item-** *Dan Howard, George Clyde*

Dan and George will look into the possibility of creating a standing "executive or "sub-council" committee within the SAC.

#### **\*\*\*Action Item-** *Dan Howard, Todd Steiner and Michael Milne*

Will invite Mark Helvey to present on the EFP at the next SAC meeting.

Also invite a member of conservation community to present.

The plan is to have the two presentations - 15 minutes each followed by a SAC vote supporting resolution.

**\*\*\*Action Item- All SAC members**

Dan requests all SAC review the Exempted Fishing Permit (EFP) document for next meeting.

Also please read the Sanctuary Act and consider what our mission is.

**\*\*\*Action Item- Dan Howard, CB staff**

Dan will consult with Karen Brubeck- national SAC coordinator.

Letter of support for Twin Otter aircraft will be drafted by CB staff and sent to SAC for review prior to next meeting.

**\*\*\*Action Item- Jaime Jahncke, CB staff**

Jaime will attend wave energy project stakeholder meetings as well as a representative from CB staff.

## **Attachment B: Research Report**

### Research Report for SAC meeting – June 2009

- 1) The CBNMS condition report is being released the week of June 15<sup>th</sup>. Electronic copies will be available at this time and a website with the full content will be posted on the national NMS website. Hard copies will not be available for another month or two.
- 2) The new oceanographic buoy was placed back out on Cordell Bank on April 21. The modified design should increase the integrity of the buoy and increase the chance of recovery if the buoy and instruments are separated from the mooring anchor. Bodega Marine Laboratory staff visited the buoy yesterday, cleaned the hull and hardware, and swapped out instrument packages.
- 3) Cordell Bank sanctuary received funding from the NOAA Coral Reef Conservation Program to build on deep-sea coral research that has been initiated at the Sanctuary. Preliminary predictive modeling describes the distribution and habitat-associations of hydrocorals and gorgonians on Cordell Bank. Project funding will allow us to refine and validate predictive models to evaluate their applicability to other rocky habitats that serve as suitable habitat for deep corals. These efforts will be instrumental in understanding the utility of these models in supporting conservation efforts and management decisions.
- 4) CBNMS undertakes a broad variety of research projects on a number of vessels. To better track the accumulating volume of data, the sanctuary office has developed a new system to describe and archive data that has been collected during research cruises. Information about data

collected on cruises is now housed in a database that is hyperlinked to the actual data on the CBNMS file server. The database contains a short summary of cruise objectives and results as well as an evaluation of data quality. A universal numbering system was developed to provide the unique key to paper and electronic records.

5) The plans to use the NOAA experimental vessel SRVx for central California research was canceled this year due to a lack of operating funds.

5) Staff members from Cordell Bank and Gulf of the Farallones sanctuaries and PRBO Conservation Science were unable to complete the season's first regional ocean monitoring cruise aboard R/V Fulmar due to extremely rough weather. Sea conditions were unworkable for 5 of the 7 scheduled days. The planned cruises cover waters of Cordell Bank and Gulf of the Farallones sanctuaries and provide integrative data on oceanographic conditions, zooplankton community, and seabird and marine mammal distribution and abundance. Summer and fall cruises are scheduled for July and September. This is a joint project with PRBO Conservation Science and GFNMS and will continue a regional data set that has been collected since 2004.

6) Lisa hosted the annual National Marine Sanctuary research coordinators' meeting at Camp Gualala, just inland from Gualala, near Annapolis. This site was chosen to expose the sanctuary staff to the coastline adjacent to the potential new expansion area for GFNMS/CBNMS. Lisa, along with the assistance of Jan Roletto, led a driving tour with participants of the research coordinators' meeting of the coastline of the potential expansion area of the Cordell Bank/Gulf of the Farallones sanctuaries as well as the existing coastline of Gulf of the Farallones sanctuary. The tour included four strategic stops along the coastline between Gualala and Pt. Reyes Station where the group discussed various issues related to conservation science activities, including challenges and opportunities that this potential new addition to the sanctuary system will bring. The feedback from the group has been summarized and is available for future planning efforts.

7) Lisa attended a Monterey Bay Aquarium Research Institute (MBARI) workshop on taxonomy and identification of deep-sea organisms from video and still images. Lisa also participated in additional sessions on identifying corals and sponges using specimens, which were sponsored by ONMS and organized by Olympic Coast sanctuary. Information obtained during the workshop, including guidance on appropriate taxonomic resolution, techniques for video collection for identification, and methods of data extraction from video, will be applied to existing and future data collection using submersibles and ROVs.

8) Lisa participated in a Google Earth/Ocean training session at the International Marine Conservation Congress meeting in Fairfax, VA and provided a modified training session to Cordell Bank sanctuary staff. Topics included: editing sanctuary information in Marine Protected Areas layer; creating and editing sanctuary information in Explore the Ocean layer; and creating kmz files, including expedition content. Cordell Bank sanctuary staff members are evaluating the goals and target audience for information distributed through Google Earth. Research and education staff is exploring the possibility of a Teacher-at-sea creating Google Earth content for Cordell Bank sanctuary.

9) Dale and Kaitlin met with staff of California Academy of Sciences (CAS), Department of Invertebrate Zoology and Geology to discuss progress of the ongoing collaboration to accession specimens collected at Cordell Bank into the permanent collection of CAS. The focus of the meeting was a discussion of database tools for cataloging species information. CBNMS is building a database to house verified information about the occurrence of all taxa in the Sanctuary. The database, which is called for in the CBNMS Conservation Science Plan, will greatly contribute to assessments of the status of the Sanctuary's living marine resources.

10) Lisa attended the International Marine Conservation Congress meeting in Fairfax, VA. There was a strong focus on marine protected areas. There were also a lot of talks dedicated to integrated ecosystem assessments as a tool to carry out ecosystem-based management. Lisa received a copy of a new book "Ecosystem-based management for the Oceans" edited by Karen McLeod and Heather Leslie. This should be a good reference for the sanctuary.

11) Cordell Bank staff conducted a pelagic survey of Cordell Bank this past Monday aboard Bodega Marine Laboratory's R/V Mussel Point. The newly fabricated observation platform worked well and staff members optimistic that the boat is a good platform for conducting surveys at Cordell Bank.